

Tammy Cloud-McMinn

From: Peggy <peggybartley45@proton.me>
Sent: Tuesday, November 12, 2024 10:32 AM
To: City Clerk
Subject: Agenda item 8 - Climate Action Plan (CAP)

All Receive - Agenda Item # 8
For the Information of the:
CITY COUNCIL
Date 11/12/24 CA CC
CM ACM DCM (3)

Climate change activists spreading "misinformation" play a large part in why the Democrats lost the 2024 election. People are not buying their hysteria that is based on untruths.

Below are two excerpts from a column by William McGurn in today's WSJ:

The Democrats' Religion

https://wallstreetjournal-ny.newsmemory.com/?publink=026f278b3_134d4fc

The Democrats' Religion "Take climate change. It comes with all the tropes of a religion: descriptions of Earth as an Eden despoiled by man, predictions of end times if we don't radically change our ways, and indulgences that allow celebrities to jet around the world so long as they drive electric cars to atone for their carbon sins. That also explains why green politics almost always elevates the radical over the sensible....A few observers have made much of the Fox News voter analysis finding that Ms. Harris outperformed Mr. Trump with the "nones." These are voters who reported no religion, and they went for her, 69% to 29%."

But don't let the "none" part kid you: The Democratic Party today holds orthodoxies, pieties and heresies every bit as dogmatic and unyielding as traditional religion. And it's the reason so many Democrats are responding to the election results not by reexamining their own policy positions but by blaming the voters for their apostasy.

Please reject the Climate Action Plan.

Peggy Bartley
Carlsbad, CA

"God's children are not for sale" Jim Caviezel

Sent with [Proton Mail](#) secure email.

CAUTION: Do not open attachments or click on links unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Tammy Cloud-McMinn

From: Barbara Diamond <diamondbarb@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, November 12, 2024 10:54 AM
To: City Clerk
Subject: Tiem # 8

Carlsbad City Council,

Tonight there will be testimony arguing how strong the CAP measures should be. For me, this is a non issue. All of us should make the maximum effort to reduce GreenHouse Gases.

Climate change is expensive and we will all be paying for it in various ways, e.g. increased taxes to cover the weather calamities, higher insurance premiums etc. Some businesses feel that they should be able to continue business as usual or their businesses would suffer serious losses.

The history of this country shows that capitalism has always recovered; think of the great depression, the stagflation of the 70's, the 2008 collapse.

For the environment, passing the tipping point means NO recovery. There is a consensus among scientists that life as we know it will not survive if the temperatures increase another three degrees. So far, the global temperature is rising despite efforts to reduce the use of fossil fuels. Timelines for predicting the tipping points range around 2045. This means that time is of the essence.

Council, the ball is in your court. I am begging you to make the difficult, but correct vote to approve of all the CAP measures. Blow back from the business community is likely and you may lose some financial support, but in exchange you will have the gratitude and respect of your average resident, their progeny and all the critters that live and breathe in this beautiful community of Carlsbad.

Sincerely,

Barbara C. Diamond

3808 Skyline Road, Carlsbad CA 92008

Tammy Cloud-McMinn

From: maryoren <maryoren@aol.com>
Sent: Tuesday, November 12, 2024 11:12 AM
To: City Clerk
Cc: Mary Oren
Subject: Item #8 11/12/24
Attachments: Council comments from team 11.12.24.docx

City of Carlsbad

November 12, 2024

Mayor, Council Members -

Thank you for your hard work to lead our beloved Carlsbad, surviving the process of running for office and taking on the responsibility of getting things done for our better future - is something we deeply appreciate! Some speaking today worked hard to get you in place to do what you do! As Stevie Wonder sang many decades ago, **Here We Are On Earth Together, It's You and I**. We share this moment up close where we see smiles and concerned faces and miraculously at a distance - technology reminds us of the spinning blue globe we share making its way around our sun every day. It's happening this minute in the room here and united on a big blue ball with a nearly full moon tagging along. With boots on the ground, I'm proud to say we've done a responsible job in Carlsbad.

So what exactly have we done? We've been open to progress, taking on needs and challenges with the kind of technology available to help us improve our quality of life. As time goes on we understand bad habits based on outdated technology can prove challenging yet we have to figure out a way to fix things.

At this moment, it's urgent. We're in that space of science and technology evolving to a better understanding of what we did right and what we did wrong, we just need leadership and community action to take a turn toward responsible progress, responsible management of our brilliant place under the sun. Carlsbad has come so far from the early days of magical water underground toward a desalination facility in place way ahead of other coastal communities. We removed an outdated energy source and eye sore along the coast and are embracing clean solar technology. We have improved road management with safer bike routes, provided popular commuter transit services that are heavily utilized and growing in routes and popularity and so much more is on the table that must be addressed now.

Over the years, we've asked and you responded as our leaders. Things don't seem to adjust on a global level fast enough these days let's be real - but that does not mean we can stop or slow down or dismiss the urgency of action in our town now. We've put together a request for you that needs quick action, ownership and dedication and we urge you to choose the CAP update with all measures, including building electrification reach codes and municipal solar carports as just the start of more solar expansion and storage to meet our energy use now and in the future.

It's so cliché but our kids and their kids and theirs - are counting on you, on us right now to do everything we can to address the serious impact our prior energy use has had on our planet, our

community, our future. We are in this together and must do all that we can to repair the damage that has been done. Science and technology has done their part, informed and given us options over the years. It is our responsibility as leaders and citizens to act on the science and technology available for us to respond to today. Thank you.

With gratitude,
Mary Oren

Carlsbad resident 25 years
Sierra Club Member

CAUTION: Do not open attachments or click on links unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

11/11/24

Mayor, council members,

At the council meeting on 11/12/24 you'll be reviewing the updated Climate Action Plan (CAP). This has been in the works for over a year and the final version will set Carlsbad on the right, sustainable path toward addressing climate change. Last month the Planning Commission by a 4-3 vote recommended adopting the CAP with the exception of removing the reach codes in E-3.2 and E-4.2 as well as E-3.3 solar carports.

I'd like to address some of the concerns related to these 3 measures based upon the letter submitted to the Planning Commission (PC) by a coalition of business interests.

- 1) On page 3 of their 8/16/24 letter to the PC they wrote: "The City should take action to LEAD in the meantime--Renewable energy expansion at city facilities, ***including solar carports at city facilities.***" The reason the PC voted to remove solar canopies wasn't due to any opposition from stakeholders in the community but the fact that that measure (E-3.3) happened to get lumped in with the 2 reach codes. By a slim majority the PC wanted to eliminate the reach codes and the solar carports were dragged along. Please remove that measure from consideration for removal.
- 2) Within the same letter was the comment "Reach codes cost money." However, no clear examples have been given to indicate this is true. Our team and staff have repeatedly told public forums (PC and council meetings) that in order for any reach code to be approved by the CA Energy Commission it must be cost effective. There are ways to write up reach code ordinances fairly quickly. First, the state has an easy-to-use tool, the Cost Effectiveness Explorer. This tool allows for mixed-fuel use in buildings. Secondly, other cities have adopted high performance reach code ordinances, specifically, Encinitas and San Luis Obispo. These, too, allow for mixed-fuel use and can be used as a starting point to create an ordinance for Carlsbad.
- 3) Another point their letter and public comments to the PC brought up, was that the updated CAP didn't do an analysis on the cost impact from reach codes on the business community. In response to that I would point out that Council never directed staff to do any such study and, furthermore, for each reach code the time to analyze cost-effectiveness is once the ordinance details have been determined and written up not before the specifics have been laid out.
- 4) The reach codes under consideration have been part of Carlsbad's CAP since 2019. These are not newly minted measures. What the businesses are asking for is a big step backwards.
- 5) Their concerns for electrifying commercial buildings are valid. Not all businesses are created equal and some, such as laboratories, may need natural gas. However, exemptions can (and have been) written into ordinances to allow for special use. Also, as mentioned above, the currently adopted reach codes in other cities allow for mixed-fuel use.
- 6) Two local developments – Laguna Row and Marja Acres – are all electric. From discussions with the architect (LR, Brett Farrow) and developer (MA, KB Home) they saved, respectively, \$100,000-200,000 and over \$1,000,000 by not installing natural gas lines to their buildings.

Carlsbad residents and businesses, contribute to the climate crisis every day by using gas in our buildings. With the CAP Update, we have the opportunity to imagine a different future for our children, and the tools to guide us.

Choosing the CAP update with all measures, including building electrification reach codes and municipal solar carports, is a necessary, strong step toward that better future.

Sincerely,

Paige DeCino on behalf of Carlsbad Sierra Club team

Tammy Cloud-McMinn

From: Janis <janisjones@me.com>
Sent: Tuesday, November 12, 2024 12:04 PM
To: City Clerk
Subject: Agenda Item #8— Climate Action Plan

Dear Honorable Mayor and City Council Members,

I urge you to adopt the Climate Action Plan as presented by Katie Hentrich, including the following:

- Measure E-3.2: Nonresidential Building Energy – Update the city’s building code (“reach code”) to include enhanced energy performance requirements for new nonresidential buildings.
- Measure E-3.3: Nonresidential Building Energy – Construct solar carports (install solar panels over outdoor parking spaces) at eligible city-owned parking lots.
- Measure E-4.2: Residential Building Energy – Update the city’s building code (“reach code”) to include enhanced energy performance requirements for new residential buildings.

Please incorporate these essential measures to ensure all possible steps are taken to reduce emissions, stabilize the climate, and safeguard a healthy planet for future generations.

Thank you for your leadership on this critical issue.

Sincerely,

Janis Jones

CAUTION: Do not open attachments or click on links unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Tammy Cloud-McMinn

From: Vanessa Forsythe <vforsythe13@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, November 12, 2024 12:33 PM
To: City Clerk
Subject: Agenda Item # 8: Support

Hello Honorable Mayor Blackburn and City Councilors

I ask that you adopt all of the measures indicated in the proposed Climate Action Plan Update including the business and residential reach codes and solar carports city owned parking lots (all of these were included in the CAP previously). My understanding is it is necessary for approval of Addendum 1 the Housing and Safety Element Update so implementation by the city can go forward.

Thank you to Katie Heinrich and other city staff for their efforts on the Updated Climate Action Plan - a tremendous effort. Throughout the plan most of the actions indicate a co-benefit to public health.

As a healthcare professional and community member I am addressing these factors why both upstream and resulting downstream measures to decrease greenhouse gases and address climate change now are necessary for approving the updated CAP along with present and implementation measures relative to the health and sustainability of our community:

1. We are experiencing more extreme weather events including: rising temperatures, drought, severe storms with flooding and landslides, rising sea levels (beach erosion), and wildfires.
2. All of these have been scientifically proven to be related to climate change and are impacting our community and planet sustainability as well as resulting in immediate health and economic costs.
3. Health and sustainability impacts:
 - impact on our crop yields and food supply
 - decreased water supply
 - increase ER visits and hospitalizations, loss or work time and school attendance
 - increase occurrence of injuries, increase episodes of overheating and heat stroke and preterm births
 - loss of green canopy and carbon sequestration as we lose trees and lagoons
 - increase allergens and pollen because longer seasons for cultivating
 - increase vector borne and infectious disease (survive in heat)
 - mental health and stress related disorders (particularly impacting our youth with increasing uncertainty and despair about their future)
 - increase occurrence and severity of lung, heart and kidney conditions
 - loss of biodiversity and extinction with extreme weather and loss of habitat - affecting insects, birds, animals and plants
 - loss of connecting with our open spaces, beaches and natural wildlife - that make Carlsbad such a wonderful place to live and visit

I refer you to this page from the [Effects of Climate Change on Health from the CDC](#). Please support the Updated CAP and continued implementation of these measures promoting a sustainable and healthy environment for all of Carlsbad now wna in the future.

Thank you for your consideration.

Vanessa

Vanessa Forsythe RN MSN

[California Nurses for Environmental Health & Justice](#)

[CleanEarth4Kids](#)

[Climate Health Now](#)

"Keep Marching...your ancestors are all the proof that you need that progress is possible not guaranteed...keep marching on...the future demands that we fight for it now"

CAUTION: *Do not open attachments or click on links unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.*

Tammy Cloud-McMinn

From: Melanie Burkholder
Sent: Tuesday, November 12, 2024 12:52 PM
To: City Clerk
Subject: Fw: Climate Action Plan



Dr. Melanie Burkholder
City Council Member, District 1
City of Carlsbad
1200 Carlsbad Village Drive
Carlsbad, CA 92008
www.carlsbadca.gov

442-339-2830 (City Hall)
442-637-2853 (mobile/text)

From: KC <restore65@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, November 12, 2024 10:42:35 AM
To: Melanie Burkholder <melanie.burkholder@carlsbadca.gov>
Subject: Climate Action Plan

Hello,

I live in District 1. I have a question about the Climate Action Plan. Are these actions mandated by the state?

Kevin Coyle

CAUTION: Do not open attachments or click on links unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Tammy Cloud-McMinn

From: Mary Hassing <mehassing@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, November 12, 2024 1:28 PM
To: City Clerk
Subject: Comments to the City Council on Agenda #8, Nov. 12

Mayor Blackburn, City Council Members,

As a resident of Carlsbad, I ask that you approve the Updated Climate Action Plan as written. City staff from every department have been involved in the creation of this draft and they made a tremendous effort to gather information from resident stakeholders. The responses from the citizens of this city are included in the draft packet and they are resoundingly in favor of a robust plan of action against climate change.

As homeowners, we are making changes, investing in solar power and heat pumps, and driving electric and hybrid vehicles. But we depend on you to make decisions that will make the biggest impact. We depend on you to stay true to the Climate Emergency Resolution you passed in 2021. Our children are watching. They know the ocean is rising. They know the droughts and wildfires are getting worse. They keep their go-bags packed for evacuation.

Please approve the CAP as written, Option #4.

Sincerely,

Mary Hassing
2679 Regent Road, Carlsbad

CAUTION: Do not open attachments or click on links unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Tammy Cloud-McMinn

From: I p <harmony1893@yahoo.com>
Sent: Tuesday, November 12, 2024 1:53 PM
To: City Clerk
Subject: Item # 8

Please include in tonight's agenda. Thank you.

I object to the adoption of the City's CAP until other parties are given equal time to express their opposing opinions to staff

Regards,
D. Persico

CAUTION: Do not open attachments or click on links unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Tammy Cloud-McMinn

From: Craig Benedetto <craigb@calstrat.com>
Sent: Tuesday, November 12, 2024 1:54 PM
To: City Clerk
Cc: Paz Gomez; James Wood; Katie Hentrich
Subject: Item #8 - Carlsbad CAP Update - Nov 12, 2024
Attachments: CBAD CAP Ltr - City Council - Nov 12, 2024.pdf

Attached, please find a letter for tonight's council hearing regarding Item #8, the City's Draft Climate Action Plan Update. Thank you for your consideration and for distribution to the City Council.

Sent by:

Craig Benedetto
California Strategies
530 B Street, Suite 920
San Diego, CA 92101

O: (619) 546-7451
C: (619) 980-8032
E: craigb@calstrat.com

www.calstrat.com

CAUTION: Do not open attachments or click on links unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

**Carlsbad Chamber of Commerce
San Diego Regional Chamber of Commerce
BOMA San Diego
Building Industry Association of San Diego
California Apartment Association
San Diego County Lodging Association
San Diego North Economic Development Council
Southern California Rental Housing Association
California Restaurant Association
Associated General Contractors San Diego
NAIOP San Diego**

TRANSMITTED ELECTRONICALLY

November 12, 2024

Honorable Keith Blackburn
Mayor
City of Carlsbad
1200 Carlsbad Village Drive
Carlsbad, CA 92008

RE: *Draft Climate Action Plan Update - Please Support Option 1 with Modifications*

Dear Mayor Blackburn and Members of the Carlsbad City Council:

On behalf of the undersigned coalition of jobs and housing providers, we are writing today in support of the Planning Commission recommended Item 1 of the options included in the November 12th staff report with a couple of additional modifications. Item 1 would remove the “reach code” items related to residential and non-residential development. In terms of modifications, we would respectfully request the removal of the requirement for electrification of construction equipment, as well as the expansion of the “transportation demand management” or TDM requirements. We would also suggest the inclusion of the solar car port requirement for government facilities, which would further demonstrate the City’s willingness to lead by example.

By adopting staff delineated Option 1 with these modifications, you are still not only meeting your near-term goals of attainment by 2035, you will also likely do so for the 2045 timeframe. This modified option still allows Carlsbad to be a leader on reducing greenhouse gas emissions (GHG), while also balancing the cost and consequences to your residents and businesses. It also helps protect against legal risk to the City in moving forward with a de facto electrification mandate through a Reach Code.

In terms of the concerns regarding the other options, the coalition is opposed to the adoption of a separate Reach Code. The state code, including the recently finalized triennial building code, is one of the most stringent in the world. And the new measures under the code would continue to ratchet up these GHG reducing measures in new construction and tenant improvements. The City’s own GHG reductions would significantly benefit from these changes once they go into effect. Going beyond with a Reach Code only puts Carlsbad at a competitive disadvantage with your neighbors as a Reach Code comes at a high cost, which would dramatically increase the cost of both residential housing and

commercial tenancy. It would also create legal risk, as was seen in the City of Berkeley, given the means of compliance with the building performance budget allowance would likely result in the need to eliminate all natural gas from buildings.

The coalition is also opposed to the new requirements related to the electrification of construction equipment. In most cases, this kind of equipment is not available and, where it is, is extremely expensive. Mass production at useful grade for construction sites is not expected for some time, if at all, given the power needs for this kind of equipment. We would recommend delaying this item until a subsequent update to better determine the state of the market.

Regarding TDM, it is a difficult measure to implement as it's expensive, unpopular with employees and impossible to manage. As was noted at the previous Planning Commission hearing, Carlsbad businesses and property owners are already avoiding triggering these requirements under the current CAP, given their high cost. Further, depending on the TDM requirements, congestion pricing and punitive parking fees would disproportionately impact lower income workers, and for the lodging industry, dissuade visitors from coming to Carlsbad. In short, expanding TDM would likely achieve little in the way of GHG reductions, and create a number of other impacts, including fewer tourists, less TOT, and for those who choose to avoid triggering the requirements, further reducing tenant improvement investments, which would age the city's building stock.

It should be noted that for both the construction equipment item, as well as the enhanced TDM measure, these are not significant drivers of GHG. Further, the staff report doesn't take into consideration the recent decision this past weekend by the California Air Resources Board to change the Low Carbon Fuel Standards (LCFS) which will, according to their staff report, significantly reduce GHG emissions.

Lastly, we continue to have concerns about the lack of financial impact analysis for the proposed actions. While the City was willing to expend money to determine the impact to itself, it didn't afford the same action for impacts to the regulated community. We believe this kind of analysis should be done before approval, not after when implementation is being considered.

In closing, we thank the Planning Commission and City staff for hearing the concerns of our coalition and providing a reasonable, yet aggressive option in the Option 1 recommendation. With our additional modifications, we would respectfully request the Council's support of Recommendation Items 1 and 2.

Sincerely,

Bret Schanzenbach, Carlsbad Chamber of Commerce
W. Erik Bruvold, San Diego North Economic Development Council
Craig Benedetto, NAIOP San Diego & BOMA San Diego
Justine Murray, San Diego Regional Chamber of Commerce
Melanie Woods, California Apartment Association
Molly Kirkland, Southern California Rental Housing Association
Chris Duggan, California Restaurant Association
Lori Holt Pfeiler, Building Industry Association of San Diego
Fred Tayco, San Diego County Lodging Association
Dustin Steiner, Associated General Contractors San Diego

CC: Paz Gomez, Deputy City Manager
James Wood, Director, Environmental Sustainability

Tammy Cloud-McMinn

From: Howard Krausz <hkrauszmd@gmail.com>
Sent: Tuesday, November 12, 2024 1:57 PM
To: City Clerk
Subject: Agenda item #8, CAP

Here are some comments I hope the council will consider before finalizing the draft CAP.

Some thoughts about the CAP Update:

Introduction 1.1 Well written. Does not deny that climate change is a critically serious problem exacerbated by humans burning fossil fuels. The CAP and its implementation need to match the challenges. Buying mitigation credits, as mentioned elsewhere in the document, is not a solution.

Figure and Table 2.1 27% of Greenhouse Gas Emissions are “Electricity” but it needs to be clear that those are from the production of electricity by fossil fuel run generators. Demand for electricity will increase rapidly. The CAP Update should include more specifics about local solar energy production, battery storage and even the possibility of a small nuclear generator as used by some submarines and aircraft carriers to reduce GHG emissions from electricity generation.

Section 2.4 CA requires PV installations in new residential construction but only low-rise multifamily housing. What about the coming high rise multifamily housing under density bonus laws?

Table 3.1 T-2 TDM program accounts for the most GHG reductions but there is little detail about how this will actually work.

T-4 Bikeway Safety improvements. These need to harmonize with new regulations about e-bikes and be done in consultation with frequent cyclists to ensure safety and to allow both e-bikes and other non-electric bikes to operate together.

Water While only 1% of GHG emissions are from water transport and delivery this doesn't include energy use for desalination, which will be increasingly necessary. Perhaps this is not the appropriate document, but water conservation, recycling and desalination will all be more necessary as population increases and climate change worsens. These water issues must be addressed and dealt with.

Urban Canopy Planting more trees for carbon sequestration and oxygen production is very important but that requires open space. The Growth Management Plan performance standard of open space is 15% of unconstrained developable land in each LFMZ must be left open. Carlsbad must require that at least 15% of the footprint of new developments be left open and should work much harder to preserve remaining open space. Where possible, rooftop gardens should be encouraged particularly on large buildings, in addition to rooftop solar panels. Brush and forest fires reduce carbon sequestration and fuel global warming.

Howard Krausz, MD

CAUTION: Do not open attachments or click on links unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

Tammy Cloud-McMinn

From: Jose Torre-Bueno <jose.torrebueno@cc-energy.org>
Sent: Tuesday, November 12, 2024 1:57 PM
To: City Clerk
Cc: Don Christiansen
Subject: Comment on Item 8 the Climate Action Plan

The Center for Community Energy, a local 501(c)3 environmental non-profit organization would respectfully like to make the following comments on the City of Carlsbad's Climate Action Plan. We are aware that including solar canopies with EV charging stations over city owned parking lots was considered as part of the Climate Action Plan. We strongly advise including this measure for the following reasons. Beyond the immediate CO2 reduction from powering some fraction of driving from locally derived solar energy there are secondary benefits to ratepayers. To the extent that energy is generated locally the need to add new long distance transmission lines is reduced. This build out of transmission infrastructure is a major factor in utility rate increases (1). An additional factor in rate increases is the necessity to upgrade the local distribution system to accommodate building and transportation electrification. A study sponsored by the CPUC estimated this will add approximately \$50 billion to utility costs (2). A follow-on study by the CEC (3) has shown this can be substantially reduced if EVs are charged during the day, so charging in city lots will be very advantageous. Further, in the future it is probable that many EVs will be bidirectional. Studies by our organization have shown that bidirectional EVs arriving home fully charged could send power into homes via bidirectional chargers, saving the owners high evening electric rates and reducing the load on the grid in the evening.(4) This load reduction can further avert the need for future rate increases.

1 Energy Strategies. (2024). *The Connected West Study*. A report commissioned by Gridworks and GridLab. Salt Lake City, UT. www.energystat.com pg 37

2 Kevala Part 1: Bottom-Up Load Forecasting and System-Level Electrification Impacts Cost Estimates pg 20

3 CEC Public Advocates Office Distribution Grid Electrification Model Supplemental Analysis March 2024

4 <https://centerforcommunityenergy.org/wp-content/uploads/2024/10/ECCE2024-Oral-Presentation.pdf>

Jose Torre-Bueno, Ph.D.
Executive Director
Center for Community Energy
(619) 977-0553



CAUTION: Do not open attachments or click on links unless you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.